

Clarification Request

Reference: ASHRAE 135-2004, Addendum 135-2004I

Background:

The B-BC profile described in 135-2004 requires support for DM-CE-A but the conditions under which it would be used are not specified.

Under what conditions does the BTL expect a device to bring up PTP connections?

Is the device required to bring up PTP connections for alarm transmissions if a Recipient is located on the far side of a PTP half-router?

If so, does this apply to MAC address entries only since normal searches for Device Ids would not result in locating the destination device?

Is the device required to bring up PTP connections for Trending and other Data Sharing purposes?

Does a device that uses PTP connections for proprietary purposes only meet the requirements of this BIBB?

The BIBB does not explicitly require the initiation of Who-Is-Router-To-Network nor the execution of I-Could-Be-Router-To-Network.

Is there an implied requirement that these network layer services be used to find the half-router to use?

Is it acceptable for a device that claims this BIBB to only connect through a statically configured half-router (only uses half-router A, even though half-router B exists and is capable)?

Does the BTL require that devices request that PTP connections be disconnected when they are done with them?

There are problems with PTP connection management due to the lack of reference counting.

If a PTP connection is dropped when a device is still needing it to be in place (for example, alarm distribution is not complete), does the BTL expect that the device will re-request that the connection be established and the disconnect it when finished?

WS-072 highlights for use cases for PTP, but points out that the one using NM-CE-A has additional problems to the ones noted in this CR, at least one of which could be costly (in terms of long-distance telephone charges) to the end user, and recommends removal of NM-CE-A as a required BIBB for the B-OWS and B-BC. The issue is not one of interoperability, but of the potential for undesired operation.

The BTL-WG intends to add PTP operation to its test suite, but for the reasons given here does not consider it advisable to test and approve a BIBB with so many unresolved questions and issues.

Determination:

The BTL will be testing PTP but not the NM-CE-A BIBB due to the many issues with that BIBB.