

Clarification Request

References: TP14 tests 9.20.1.7, 9.20.1.8, 9.20.1.9

Date of BTL-WG Response: 2017-Aug-17

All actions necessitated have been completed

Background:

9.20.1.9 Reading REQUIRED Properties

Reason for Change: Modified test to remove dependency on EPICS values. Addendum 135-2008x. Addendum 135-2010ao-5

Purpose: To verify the ability to correctly execute a ReadPropertyMultiple service request that uses the special property identifier REQUIRED. One instance of each object-type supported is tested. *The property identifier REQUIRED means that only those standard properties having a conformance code of "R" or "W" shall be returned.*

Test Steps:

```

1. REPEAT ObjectX = (one instance of each supported object type) DO {
    TRANSMIT ReadPropertyMultiple-Request,
        'Object Identifier' = ObjectX,
        'Property Identifier' = REQUIRED
    RECEIVE ReadPropertyMultiple-ACK,
        'Object Identifier' = ObjectX,
        REPEAT P = (each required property defined for Object1ObjectX) DO {
            'Property Identifier' = P,
            'Property Value' = (any valid value for P the value of P specified in the EPICS)
        }
    }

```

Notes to Tester: If a property which is not readable using the ReadPropertyMultiple service is in the specified object, and Protocol_Revision < 7, then either no entry is returned, or an error code is returned. If Protocol_Revision >= 7, then the entry shall contain 'Error Class': PROPERTY and 'Error-Code': READ ACCESS DENIED for that property. Property List (371) shall not appear in the List of Results.

Problem:

- the purpose indicates, that the test should check that only required properties are returned by the IUT in the RPM ACK. But the RECEIVE statement seems to only ensure that all required properties are present; there is no check to prevent additional (optional or proprietary or reserved) properties.
- same sort of problem applies to 9.20.1.7 for ALL and 9.20.1.8 for OPTIONAL.

Question:

should the missing check against additional properties be added to the three RPM tests for the three special property identifiers?

RESPONSE:

Yes.

The testcase will be modified.