

Clarification Request

References: ASHRAE 135-2008x-3 section 12.

Date of BTL-WG Response: Dec 4, 2012

Background / Proposed Solution:

The existing test 9.15.2.2 observes the effect of RemoveListElement Failure Part Way Through a List.

9.15.2.2 A RemoveListElement Failure Part Way Through a List

Reason For Change: The test specified an incorrect error code. This is included in WS-038-4.

Purpose: To verify the ability of the IUT to respond to a RemoveListElement service request to remove multiple elements from a list where one of the elements cannot be removed. Upon failure, the RemoveListElement service should leave the list unchanged.

Test Steps:

1. TRANSMIT ReadProperty-Request,
 'Object Identifier' = L,
 'Property Identifier' = ListProp
2. RECEIVE ReadProperty-ACK,
 'Object Identifier' = L,
 'Property Identifier' = ListProp,
 'Property Value' = (any valid value referred to as "InitialList" below)
3. TRANSMIT RemoveListElement-Request,
 'Object Identifier' = L,
 'Property Identifier' = ListProp
 'List of Elements' = (one element from InitialList, followed by an element of the
 correct datatype that is not in InitialList, followed by one or more
 elements from InitialList)
4. *If (Protocol_Revision is present and Protocol_Revision >= 7) THEN*
 RECEIVE RemoveListElement-Error,
 Error Class = ~~SERVICES+PROPERTY SERVICES,~~
 Error Code = ~~OTHER LIST_ELEMENT_NOT_FOUND~~
 'First Failed Element' = 2
 ELSE
 RECEIVE RemoveListElement-Error
5. VERIFY (L), ListProp = InitialList

In Addendum 135-2008x-3, the sentence:

Assuming that the list has not been written or modified, repeated reading of list elements shall return those elements in the same order each time.

Seems applicable during test 9.15.2.2 But also:

The ordering of list elements when a list is written or modified is not required to be preserved upon subsequent reading of the same list, even if the set of elements that make up the list has not changed.

which is an earlier sentence in that same new section 135-2008x-3 of the standard could be dominant.

Question:

Is it a defect if at Step 5., it is observed that the items in list Property remains the same, but the order of items in the List property was changed?

Response:

Yes, it is a defect. The list has not been written or modified.