

Clarification Request

References: “e.g” **Specified Tests** 9.20.1.X2

Date of BTL-WG Response: October 1, 2020

☒ All Actions Necessitated have been Completed

Background:

9.20.1.X2 ReadPropertyMultiple Array Properties

Purpose: To verify that the IUT can execute ReadPropertyMultiple service requests when the requested property is an array, when its size as well as when a single element of the array is requested. Another request is made to read an element of an array where the array index is out of range.

Configuration Requirement: O1 is any object in the IUT database having array property P1 having size X.

Test Steps:

1. VERIFY P1 = X, ARRAY INDEX = 0
2. IF (X>0) THEN
3. TRANSMIT ReadPropertyMultiple-Request,

 'Object Identifier' = O1,

 'Property Identifier' = P1,

 'Property Array Index' = 1
4. RECEIVE ReadPropertyMultiple-ACK,

 'Object Identifier' = O1,

 'Property Identifier' = P1,

 'Property Array Index' = 1,

 'Property Value' = (V, any valid value of the correct data type for property P1)
5. TRANSMIT ReadPropertyMultiple-Request,

 'Object Identifier' = O1,

 'Property Identifier' = P1,

 'Property Array Index' = X,

6. RECEIVE ReadPropertyMultiple-ACK,

 'Object Identifier' = O1,

 'Property Identifier' = P1,

 'Property Array Index' = X,

 'Property Value' = (V, any valid value of the correct data type for property P1)
7. CHECK (V is any valid value of the correct data type for property P1)
8. TRANSMIT ReadPropertyMultiple-Request,

 'Object Identifier' = O1,

 'Property Identifier' = P1,

 'Property Array Index' = (X+1)
9. RECEIVE ReadPropertyMultiple-Error,

 Error Class = PROPERTY,

 Error Code = INVALID_ARRAY_INDEX

from 135-2016 15.7.2

If none of the specified objects is found or if none of the specified properties of the specified objects can be accessed, either a 'Result(-)' primitive or a Result(+) primitive that returns error codes for all properties shall be issued.

Problem:

step 9:

the test specification expects an error for the RPM with a single property with an array index, that is out of range.

But the implementation should have the choice whether to return an error or return a positive complex ACK with one entry and an error in that entry.

Questions:

Should a product pass the test when it returns a complex ack in step 9 indicating the error for the property inside the complex ack?

Response:

Yes.