

Clarification Request

References: BTL Test Plan 5.0, 135.1 -2007 tests 9.17.1.1 and 9.16.1.2

Date of BTL-WG Response: July 2, 2021

9.17.1.1 is the primary test to verify correct execution of the DeleteObject service.

9.17.1.1 Successful Deletion of an Object

Reason For Change: Clarified the parameter description for the initial verify. There is no SSPC proposal for this test.

Purpose: To verify the ability to successfully delete an object.

Configuration Requirements: The IUT shall be configured with an object X that can be deleted.

Test Steps:

1. VERIFY (X), Object_Name = *(any valid value)*
2. TRANSMIT DeleteObject-Request,
 'Object Identifier' = X
3. RECEIVE BACnet-Simple-ACK-PDU
4. TRANSMIT ReadProperty-Request,
 'Object Identifier' = X,
 'Property Identifier' = Object_Name
5. RECEIVE BACnet-Error-PDU,
 Error Class = OBJECT,
 Error Code = UNKNOWN_OBJECT
6. VERIFY (X), Object_List = (any object list that does not contain X)

Question:

In the test 9.17.1.1, is a vendor restriction that X must be the most recently created object of a given object type, a permitted restriction? We observe a vendor that stores the dynamically created objects in a LIFO manner. When we choose X to be a dynamically created object-identifier other than that of the most recently created, the result is Error class: SERVICES, Error Code: OBJECT_DELETION_NOT_PERMITTED.

Permission to observe this restriction, if granted, would be expected to similarly affect test 9.16.1.2 where when X is chosen to be an object-identifier with other than the next sequential integer value as the instance, returns Error Class: DEVICE, Error Code: DYNAMIC_CREATION_NOT_SUPPORTED.

Response:

Yes. While this restriction is valid, the BTL believes this will result in a less-than-satisfactory user experience and recommends vendors do not implement a device that behaves in this manner.